THE EFL STUDENTS’ ANXIETY IN AN ONLINE PUBLIC SPEAKING CLASS AT AN INDONESIAN UNIVERSITY

ANNISA INDIRA SULISTYOWATI
Sanata Dharma University, Indonesia

THOMAS WAHYU PRABOWO MUKTI
Sanata Dharma University, Indonesia
Corresponding author: thomaswpm@usd.ac.id

Abstract
One of the main challenges for English as Foreign Language (EFL) students in public speaking class was Foreign Language Anxiety (FLA). Due to COVID-19, the public speaking class must be conducted online. This study aimed to examine the level of FLA in online public speaking classes and discovered the impacts on students’ feelings upon joining the online public speaking class. This research used a quantitative research approach and survey methodology. The research was conducted in online public speaking classes for fifth-semester students at Sanata Dharma University. The researchers took 50 students from the total population of 159 students in batch 2019 using random sampling and the survey questionnaires in Google forms were distributed through Whatsapp group. The level of FLA was investigated through the Modified Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety Scale (MFLCAS), and the impacts of FLA were explored using Modified Foreign Language Virtual Classroom Anxiety Scale (MFLVCAS). The results showed that students experienced a moderate level of FLA with a mean of 3.00 by three dimensions; Communication Apprehension (CA), Fear of Negative Evaluation (FNE), and Test Anxiety (TA). There were no adverse impacts from online public speaking classes related to FLVCAS. The online classroom setting did not bring another source of anxiety to the students. Based on the findings, students who do not have any internet or technical issues should always turn on their cameras during the online speaking class. Future research that compares students’ achievement in online public speaking class and offline public speaking class can be done to have a better depth comparison between these two teaching approaches.

Keywords: public speaking, online public speaking, foreign language anxiety

Introduction

Foreign language anxiety (FLA) is the feelings of nervousness and apprehension experienced by EFL students when they are learning English (Horwitz, 2001). Intuitively, anxiety would inhibit the learning and production of a second language (L2) (Horwitz, 2010). This situation commonly happens when students need to speak in front of an audience and even students could have unfavorable
Anxious students are often more prone to underestimate their language proficiency and avoid risky behaviors, such as speaking in class or attempting to explain complicated ideas (Gregersen et al., 2014; MacIntyre, 1994). As the result, many students who are fine to share their ideas in any everyday situation are terrified of delivering a speech in front of audience (Foss & Reitzel, 1988) and even anxiety could lead to failure (Ezzi, 2012).

English Language Education Study Programme (ELESP) at Sanata Dharma University holds public speaking class as a compulsory course for fifth-semester students. This class is designed to introduce students to the underlying principles of speaking in public and provide hands-on experiences to develop public speaking skills. In this situation, FLA is likely to be experienced by students. Due to COVID-19, the public speaking class must be conducted online. According to research, many communication faculties do not agree that certain courses, such as interpersonal communication, public speaking, and writing, should not be taught online (Vanhorn et al., 2008). This narrative exists because the public speaking class requires a real-life experience of delivering a speech in front of a large audience. It could not be experienced through the online course. The real-life experience that fulfills students' progress in practicing their oral skills can only be attained through the offline class.

There is a big difference between face-to-face and online public speaking class. In face-to-face classes, students deliver their speech directly in front of the classroom. They get the experience of having a speech in front of a large audience. They need to be well prepared for delivering their speech directly in front of the audience. They need to memorize their speech, master their full-body gestures, and style their full-body appearance. In addition, students need to face real audience who can determine their level of anxiety (Pertaub et al., 2002). Meanwhile, students do not directly deliver their speeches in online public speaking classes. In this study, students need to record their speech using their camera or smartphone for time efficiency. They did not deliver their speech directly through video conference meetings in Zoom since it was considered not time efficient. Therefore, the lecturer asked the students to record their speech and upload it on YouTube. Since it was pre-recorded speech, students could retake their speech video several times. The retake speech opportunity could not be experienced in the offline class setting. Research done by Kaisar and Chowdhury (2020) highlights the lack of necessary components of interaction which lead students to feel secluded, uncomfortable, bored, and consequently become anxious about their language achievement or students might even anxious when they use the application itself (Brown et al., 2004; Garrison et al., 1999; Holmes & Meyerhoff, 2003). This research explored not only Foreign Language Anxiety (FLA) but also the impacts of FLA related to Foreign Language Virtual Classroom Anxiety (FLVCA). Therefore, this study is aimed to investigate the level of foreign language anxiety in online public speaking classes and discover the impacts on students' feelings upon joining the online public speaking class.
Literature Review

**Foreign language anxiety**

Foreign Language Anxiety (FLA) is a distinct complex of self-perceptions, beliefs, feelings, and behaviors related to classroom language learning arising from the uniqueness of the language learning experience (Aida, 1994; Horwitz 2001; Horwitz et al., 1986). Foreign language anxiety is specific anxiety experienced by language learners when they are learning a language. It does not come from general anxiety, but it comes from the particular experience of learning a language (Oteir & Al-Otaibi, 2019). Language researchers agree that anxiety from the language learning process is one of the primary obstacles for EFL learners learning English (Alrabai, 2014; Male, 2018). The effects of foreign language anxiety could either motivate students or demotivate students in learning. Since it brings many influences, it is important to identify students' anxiety in foreign language classes. Horwitz et al., (1986) developed Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety Scale (FLCAS) to measure the levels of anxiety that students experience when they are learning a foreign language. FLCAS consists of 33 items, a self-report questionnaire using the Likert scale to explore the three dimensions of FLA; Communication Apprehension (CA), Test Anxiety (TA), and Fear of Negative Evaluation (FNE).

**Types of foreign language anxiety**

According to Horwitz et al. (1986), there are three types of Foreign Language Anxiety (FLA). These three types of FLA can be found when students perform their English skills.

*Communication apprehension* (CA) is the experience of nervousness, worry, and discomfort when students speak in English class (Horwitz et al., 1986). Students who experience communication apprehension will have difficulties expressing their ideas in English. They need some time to construct their ideas and often use too many fillers when speaking (Gawi, 2020). Using too many fillers will distract the audience from engaging the speaker's ideas.

*Fear of negative evaluation* is a type of anxiety indicated by fear of other people's evaluations, avoidance of evaluative circumstances, and the expectation that others would negatively evaluate them (Horwitz et al., 1986). Fear of negative evaluation is closely associated with fear of communication and it drives students to feel uncertain about their abilities to communicate in English (Watson & Friend, 1969). AlNatour’s (2018) study found that this is one of the student of the common experiences. Students feel afraid that the other parties do not understand what they are trying to express and feel that their English is lacking in many ways. Fear of negative evaluation makes students passive in practicing their oral skills. They tend to be afraid of making mistakes and choose to remain silent. This passive attitude will slow down students' progress in learning speaking skills. Eventually, students could withdraw from class activities.

*Test anxiety* (TA) is the Fear of failing academic tests and an unpleasant experience carried either consciously or unconsciously by learners in various contexts. Students who experience test anxiety are afraid of the consequences of failing the exam, consequently, they cannot concentrate and give their best on the exam (AlNatour, 2018; Aydin, 2009). Due to test anxiety, teachers cannot
get credible exam results to evaluate students' learning progress. Credible exam results are essential for improving the best teaching approach to mastering speaking skills.

**The impacts of foreign language anxiety**

There are three impacts of foreign language anxiety. The first one is the impact on academic performance. There is a negative relationship between foreign language anxiety and academic achievement (Horwitz, 2001). Students who experience foreign language anxiety feel uncomfortable due to their anxiety and cannot fully concentrate on language learning. It leads them to have a shallow understanding to perform well in academics. The second impact is low interest in communication. According to Horwitz (2010), foreign language anxiety lowers students' motivation to communicate with others. They tend to become passive in classroom activities. The third impact is undeveloped cognitive performance. Foreign language anxiety blocks students' cognitive performance in learning the language. The students will focus more on controlling their anxious feelings than on learning the language. They cannot fully concentrate on the learning process, and it will slow down their language learning progress.

**Foreign language virtual classroom anxiety**

Studies by Kaisar and Chowdhury (2020) and Al-Qahtani (2019) show students did not experience technophobia and felt comfortable exploring the use of technology to learn English in a virtual class setting. Students had shown active participation attitudes in engaging with classroom activities. In addition, they also felt confident using facial gestures and eye contact in virtual language classrooms. They do not feel isolated in practicing their English through a virtual language classroom. However, Brown et al., (2004) show that computer anxiety and oral communication apprehension correlate to computer-mediated communication (CMC) anxiety, affecting students' attitudes and learning achievements. Students who do not experience CMC anxiety can excel better in their learning process.

**Methodology**

**Research design and approach of the study**

This research is quantitative. This approach was chosen because the researchers needed to quantify the levels of Foreign Language Anxiety (FLA) behavior in online public speaking classes. Specifically, this study employed a survey methodology which has been widely used to describe and explore human behavior in social and psychological research (Creswell, 2018; Singleton & Straits, 2012). The survey allowed the writer to determine the level, types, and impacts of FLA in online public speaking classes. The researchers distributed two survey questionnaires, Modified Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety Scale (MFLCAS) and Modified Foreign Language Virtual Classroom Anxiety Scale (MFLVCAS), through Google Forms. The researcher adopted MFLCAS which was originally initiated by Horwitz et al. (1986) to determine the level of FLA, it has been widely used to
determine students’ FLA. The MFLVCAS was adapted from Kaisar and Chowdhury (2020) to find out the impacts of FLA in online class setting, this survey questionnaire was chosen because it pointed out the impacts of FLA that students might experience during online class.

**Research setting**

The research was conducted in online public speaking classes for fifth-semester students at Sanata Dharma University. The writers gathered the questionnaire and interview data in the middle of November 2021. To enrich the research, the writers also observed three online public speaking class meetings in the last week of November and the first week of December 2021.

**Research participants**

According to Creswell (2018), the research participants in a quantitative study are estimated from 10-50 participants, it depends on the research questions. In this study, the total number of students in batch 2019 is 159 consisting of 44 male and 115 female students. This study took 50 fifth-semester students in public speaking class using random sampling. The survey questionnaire was distributed to the students’ batch 2019 Whatsapp group. Those numbers more or less represent 30% of the total population and student composition where 28% of students are male and 72% of students are female. The participants then were coded using pseudonyms namely A for the first participant until AX for the fifty participants.

**Instruments and data gathering technique**

*Modified foreign language classroom anxiety scale (MFLCAS)*, the first instrument was MFLCAS to determine students’ FLA levels. MFLCAS was adapted from the Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety Scale (FLCAS) initiated by Horwitz et al. (1986). FLCAS consists of 33 items, a self-report questionnaire using the Likert scale to assess students’ FLCAS related to communication apprehension, test anxiety, and fear of negative evaluation. MFLCAS consists of 15 self-report questionnaire items using a Likert scale adapted from FLCAS. The researchers did not include statements from FLCAS that are not relevant to the study and not observable, for example, “I would not be nervous speaking the foreign language with native speakers.” The respondents gave their responses to the statements by choosing to either (1) strongly agree, (2) agree, (3) neither agree nor disagree, (4) disagree, or (5) strongly disagree.

*Modified foreign language virtual classroom anxiety scale (MFLVCAS)*, the second instrument was MFLVCAS. MFLVCAS was adapted from Foreign Language Virtual Classroom Anxiety Scale (FLVCAS) developed by Kaisar and Chowdhury (2020). FLVCAS consists of 7 items of a self-report questionnaire using three scales (agree, disagree, and neutral) to discover the virtual classroom features that create FLA. The MFLVCAS consists of 7 items self-report questionnaire using the Likert Scale. The respondents gave their responses on FLA by choosing to either (1) strongly agree, (2) agree, (3) neither agree nor disagree, (4) disagree, or (5) strongly disagree.
Observation log, this observation log uses checklists to see behaviors and responses shown by the participants of this study. Ary et al. (2010) say observation allows the researchers to “determine whether what is said matches actions or may illuminate subtleties that may be outside the consciousness of the person or that the person cannot articulate (p.432).”

Interview guidelines, the researchers employed interview guidelines to explore the research subjects’ opinions and experiences during their Public Speaking online class. The guideline consists of four questions focusing on participants feeling about joining online Public Speaking class and students’ preferences regarding the mode of the class as well as how the practice should be conducted. The participants were selected using stratified random sampling by selecting two representatives from each quartile. The interview helped researchers to get in-depth information (Ary et al., 2010).

Data analysis techniques

After gathering all data from Google forms and calculating the score from each statement, the researchers analyzed the highest, lowest score, and the mean from the Likert scale results in each statement. The mean data from each statement were analyzed through the descriptive table.

Table 1. Level of FLA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mean Score Range</th>
<th>Level of Anxiety</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.21-5.00</td>
<td>Very Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.41-4.20</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.61-3.40</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.81-2.60</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.00-1.80</td>
<td>Very High</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the descriptive table, the researchers drew a conclusion related to the level of anxiety, the most common anxiety dimensions, and the impacts of online public speaking classes related to FLVCAS. The researchers then transcribed the interview results, analyzed, and categorized the data based on the themes namely, types of emotions and anxiety. To ensure the validity of the analysis, the researchers conducted inter-rater checking. Lastly, the data were triangulated using observation data from the meetings (how many meetings?) to confirm the results both from the questionnaire and interview.

Results and Discussion

*Foreign language anxiety (FLA) experienced in online public speaking class*

The Modified Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety Scale (MFLCAS) questionnaire results showed an overall mean of 3.00. It was considered a moderate level of FLA.
Table 2. Foreign language anxiety (FLA) experienced in online public speaking class students’ responses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimension of Anxiety</th>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Communication Apprehension (CA)</td>
<td>It frightens me when I don't understand what the teacher is saying in English.</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>2.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I start to panic when I have to speak without preparation in online public speaking class.</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>2.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I would be nervous when I have to deliver my English speeches in online public speaking class.</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>2.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I get upset when I don't understand what the teacher is correcting.</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>3.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I don't feel confident when I speak English in online public speaking class.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>3.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I can feel my heart pounding when I'm going to be called on in online public speaking class.</td>
<td>132</td>
<td>2.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fear of negative evaluation (FNE)</td>
<td>I worry about making mistakes in online public speaking class.</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>2.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I tremble when I know that I'm going to be called on in online public speaking class.</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>2.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I keep thinking that the other students are better at English than I am.</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>2.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I always feel that the other students speak English better than I do.</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>2.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I am afraid that the other students will laugh at me when I speak in English.</td>
<td>174</td>
<td>3.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Test Anxiety (TA)</td>
<td>I usually feel nervous during tests in online public speaking class.</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>3.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I worry about the consequences of failing online public speaking class.</td>
<td>131</td>
<td>2.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The more I study for a language test, the more confused I get.</td>
<td>184</td>
<td>3.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I feel overwhelmed by the number of rules I have to learn to speak in English.</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>3.02</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In general overview, the highest mean is 3.68. It was considered a low level of FLA. The highest mean of FLA was related to test anxiety (TA) in the statement, "The more I study for a language test, the more confused I get.". The lowest mean was 2.62. It was considered as a moderate level of FLA. The lowest mean of FLA was correlated to test anxiety (TA) in the statement, "I worry about the consequences of failing the online public speaking class.". Unlike Ezzi's (2012) and Suleimenova's (2013) studies, this study shows the majority of students had positive experiences in speaking class. On the other hand, this study confirms Broeckelman-Post's et al., (2019) and Westwick's et al., (2015, 2018) studies which show a decrease in students’ anxiety compared to students who joined face-to-face classroom. To dig deeper, the researchers also analyze the FLA based on students’ genders.
The data above showed female students had slightly higher FLA level compared to male students who on average had a low level of anxiety. It confirms Ezzi’s (2012) study which revealed female students tend to have higher anxiety level than the male students.

**Communication apprehension**

Communication apprehension (CA) is the experience of nervousness, worry, and discomfort when students speak in English class (Gawi, 2020). The highest level of FLA in CA was 3.40 (moderate level of FLA) in the statement "I don't feel confident when I speak English in online public speaking class." In the interview, half of the respondents experienced negative emotions related to CA. Those negative emotions were nervousness and anxiety when speaking English in the online public speaking class. They felt nervous because they did not master the materials and had to talk spontaneously. The nervous feelings made them use many fillers and stutter to deliver their speech. They also felt anxious when speaking in the online public speaking class. They were afraid that others did not get what they were trying to deliver.

To confirm students’ answers, the researchers asked about their feeling in online public speaking class. There are notable answers regarding this issue. The first issue is students’ negative perceptions.

“I sometimes feel nervous when I have to present something or speak spontaneously. I don't know what to say. I am afraid if my English is incorrect, and people don't understand what I am delivering.” (X)

“I feel a bit worried because everyone turns off their camera. I don't know their reactions. I don't know if they like me or not.” (AJ)

“Speaking English in online class isn't challenging and engaging for me. My friends do not turn on their camera and I feel like I am speaking to my laptop.” (AP)
“I feel extremely nervous when I have to speak spontaneously.” (AF)

Feeling nervous, afraid, and worried highlighted students’ feelings during online public speaking. There was also a student who felt online class was boring since there was less interaction. The other half of the respondents experienced positive emotions related to CA. They felt confident speaking in the online public speaking class. They felt confident because they had time to prepare their speech, and they did not have to face the audience directly. The researchers observed some videos from an online public speaking class and noticed that some students who experienced negative emotions often made many movements and used many fillers. They also often made awkward facial expressions. In contrast, students who experienced positive emotions looked comfortable and confident in expressing their ideas during the online public speaking class. They did not make awkward facial expressions or use many fillers.

“I feel confident, I do not feel anxious or scared to speak in zoom class because we don't have to face them directly. Sometimes we can turn off our camera too and it makes me feel more confident. It is different when you talk in real life because it has more pressure.” (A)

The lowest FLA in CA was 2.64. It was considered a moderate level of anxiety. In the sentence, "I can feel my heart pounding when I'm going to be called on in online public speaking class.". In the interview, 8 of 8 students stated that they felt nervous when the lecturer gave a question and asked some students to answer it directly. The students said they knew what they wanted to say, but when they heard their names was being called, it made them anxious. When their name was being called, the whole class would pay full attention to them, and it gave them pressure (X, AU, AF. Interview). Often it made them forget about their ideas. They felt the pressure, but it did not demotivate them to practice their speaking skills.

Slowly through the online public speaking class, they learned how to handle their anxious feelings when they heard the lecturer calling their name. From the classroom observation log, the researchers noticed that students looked more comfortable with the online public speaking class each week and knew how to handle their anxious feelings. During the first three weeks of online conversation class, they still needed time to answer impromptu questions and looked anxious. However, they looked comfortable expressing their ideas on an impromptu question as time passed.

**Fear of negative evaluation**

Fear of Negative Evaluation (FNE) is a type of anxiety indicated by Fear of other people's evaluations, avoidance of evaluative circumstances, and the expectation that others would negatively evaluate them (Watson & Friend, 1969). Based on the questionnaire result, the highest mean in FNE was 3.48. It was considered a low level of FLA. In the sentence, "I am afraid that the other students will laugh at me when I speak in English.". The lowest mean in FNE was 2.76. It was considered a moderate level of FLA. In the sentence, "I always feel that the other students speak English better than I do.".

The data show students were concerned about their peers’ reactions to their speeches. It also affected their confidence level when they were delivering their speeches. Positive responses
from their peers will boost their confidence. In online public speaking classes, not everyone turned on their camera. It was hard to tell whether their peers gave positive or negative reactions. That factor may lead them to develop a moderate level of FNE.

On the other hand, in the interview, some students stated that they were worried about their friends’ reactions when delivering their speeches. They did not know their friends’ facial expressions because most of them turned off their cameras. This condition made them worry and nervous. They were afraid that their friends would laugh at them or dislike their speeches.

“I feel a bit worried because everyone turns off their camera. I don’t know their reactions. I don’t know if they like me or not. In the main room session, I feel like everyone is judging me, and it makes me afraid. They turn off their camera. It also makes me nervous. I don’t know if they laugh at me or how they react to my speech.” (X)

In the interview, some students also said that they were concerned that some of their friends spoke English better than them. They knew that their friends were more fluent in English than them (X, H, AU. Interview). It made them anxious and feel intimidated by them. One student overcame this anxious feeling by texting their friends who were more fluent in English to get encouragement. She said that receiving warm encouragement from those fluent students made her feel confident (H). The researchers noticed that the classroom atmosphere was quite awkward and cold from the classroom observation log when most of the students did not turn on their cameras. Students who turned on their cameras might show no reactions after their friends delivered their speeches. From the questionnaire, interview, and classroom observation log, it was confirmed that online public speaking classes could still give the fear of negative evaluations even though students did not speak directly to public audiences in a real-life setting and see the audience’s reactions.

Test anxiety

Test anxiety (TA) is the fear of failing academic tests, and an unpleasant experience carried consciously or unconsciously by learners in various contexts (Aydın, 2009). The highest mean in TA was 3.68. It was considered a low level of FLA. It can be found in the sentence, “The more I study for a language test, the more confused I get.” The lowest mean in TA was 2.62. It was considered a moderate level of FLA. It can be found in the sentence, “I worry about the consequences of failing the online public speaking class.” In short, we can see that students knew their way of learning to master the materials in online public speaking classes. They did not get confused or feel under pressure when studying for public speaking assignments or exams.

In the interview, all the students stated that they felt comfortable with the assignments and exams in the online public speaking class. They had a weekly assignment to make an audio journal to practice their oral and English skills. They needed to submit the weekly assignment in audio format, and the maximum duration was 3 minutes. For their midterms and final exam, they needed to record a speech video with a duration of 5-8 minutes and upload it on Youtube. The students said they did not face many difficulties in doing the assignments and the exams. They can retake their audio journal and video several times before submitting them. The students submitted their best audio journal and video that they were most satisfied with after several retakes. The students said they
could also make notes and read them to make the best results during the recording process. They knew that they should not read and rely on those notes or full text of their speech. They were afraid of the consequences of getting used to relying on these notes. They were worried that they would face a hard time when delivering a speech in a real-life setting. They were not afraid to fail the online public speaking class in terms of scores but capabilities.

**The impacts of online public speaking class related to foreign language virtual classroom anxiety (FLVCA)**

The second research question aimed to determine the impacts of online public speaking classes related to Foreign Language Virtual Classroom Anxiety (FLVCA). The researchers wanted to investigate whether online public speaking classes became another source of anxiety or not. The online class setting might become another source of anxiety that slows down students learning process. Students only needed to deal with FLA in a face-to-face public speaking class. In an online public speaking class, students might also deal with FLVCA because of the online setting.

Table 3. *Summarized results of FLVCA*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I have techno-phobia</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel isolated during online public speaking class</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel uneasy thinking that teacher or fellow students might see my home setting</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel fear to be disconnected during online public speaking class</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel anxious thinking that the teacher does not see my non-verbal</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long time use of technology during online public speaking class makes</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>me anxious about my physical and mental health</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The online public speaking class setting makes me feel more suffocated</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>than a real classroom</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results of MFLVCA showed that students did not experience FLVCA and had positive attitudes to overcome their FLA in online public speaking classes. 42% of the students did not have techno-phobia. The students were familiar and confident with their ability to learn in an online setting using technology. 32% of the students did not feel isolated in an online setting. 34% of students were comfortable with their home settings in an online class. Students were pleased with their online class setting from their home. They did not experience negative emotions related to the online setting. The students had moderate experiences in learning using computer-mediated communication (Brown et al., 2004; Garrison et al., 2000) and other devices during the pandemic which lead students to have less anxiety.
Based on students’ gender, here is the average FLVCA of the students.

Figure 2. Students’ FLVCA level

Based on the data, both male and female students show low level of FLVCA. One of the contributors is students were already familiar with the technology needed in the classroom. However, half of the students were anxious about getting disconnected from their internet connection. In the interview, 25% of the students said that when they got disconnected, it made them panic. However, it did not give them intense anxious feelings. 24% of the students did not feel ignored by their lecturer during the online classroom setting. It indicated that the lecturer managed to build a supportive atmosphere for learning. The researchers confirmed that the lecturer paid detailed attention to students' gestures from the classroom observation log. The lecturer often gave comments related to students' gestures not for the sake of formality but also to build an intimate connection with them.

From the interview, 7 of 8 students chose the face-to-face public speaking class over the online public speaking class. One of the main considerations is that they believe face-to-face public speaking will give them more hands-on experiences. X mentioned, “I prefer the face-to-face public speaking class. Even though I will deal with a more intense FLA but I think it will help me to build my confidence.” (X)

All interviewees were aware that they would experience more intense FLA. However, they believed that the intense FLA in face-to-face public speaking is what they needed to overcome their FLA and make them confident when they need to speak in real situations. In the online public speaking class, students considered that they did not know how to handle their FLA in a real-life setting and the experience of managing real interactions with real audiences although in terms of assessment, they might get better ones since they could prepare better and retake the tasks, unlike in the face-to-face setting.
It can be concluded that this research shows contrasting results to Kaisar and Chowdury's (2020) study which shows that most students had problems in their virtual class. The online public speaking class did not negatively impact the learning and give additional anxieties to the students. The students were comfortable with their online class setting. However, based on students’ explanations, they still prefer the face-to-face class.

**Students' attitude toward FLA**

Since the students in the online public speaking class did not experience FLVCA, the researchers conducted an in-depth interview to investigate students' attitudes toward their FLA. It was correlated with how students handled their FLA during the online public speaking class to minimize their FLA. Eight respondents showed a positive attitude toward their FLA. They all experienced FLA, but they demonstrated positive attitudes to overcome their FLA. Every student had their way to overcome their FLA; practice with foreigners, speak slowly, get encouragement from their peers, and enjoy the class atmosphere.

The researchers concluded that with no FLVCA and a positive attitude towards FLA, students had a good experience in the online public speaking class. The online public speaking class did not bring any harmful impacts that might slow down students' learning process. It confirms the research done by Pratiwi, Ubaedillah, Puspitasari, & Arifianto (2022) that shows the online learning promotes students active engagement in online speaking class. Students were comfortable with their online class setting and made progress in their speaking and oral skills. Due to no FLVCA, students can focus on overcoming their FLA with positive attitudes in learning.

**Conclusion and Recommendations/Implications**

Students in online public speaking classes experienced a moderate level of FLA with an overall mean of 3.00. The highest level of FLA in Communication Apprehension was 3.40, which is considered a moderate level of FLA. This study also confirms Arindra and Ardil's (2020) study in which most students have moderate level of anxiety when they received assessment rubrics beforehand. Female students showed higher level of anxiety, although it was still in moderate level, than male students. Some notable reasons made students anxious. First, they had to speak spontaneously when their lecturer called their name. Second, they were afraid others did not understand what they were trying to deliver. The highest level of FLA in Fear of Negative Evaluation was 3.48, which is considered a moderate level of FLA. Factors contributing to this were feeling worried about their friends' reactions which they could not see because they turned off their cameras. They were afraid that their friends would laugh at them or dislike their speeches. The highest level of FLA in Test Anxiety was 3.68. It was considered a low level of FLA and it showed students were not worried about their test results.

Based on these findings, students who do not have any internet or technical issues should always turn on their cameras during the online speaking class. Turning on their cameras will give real-life audience sense to their friends, making them take the course seriously. For the assignments and exams videos, students should not rely on their notes or read the full text of their speech. It
would be better if they could learn to strategize how to deliver their speech naturally without notes or full text. The strategy can help them later when they have to deliver a speech in a real-life setting. In addition, the researchers found that every student retook their assignments or exam videos several times. They even read some notes or full text of their speech during the recording. Teachers or lecturers may reconsider having real-time speech performances for the exam through Zoom and oblige students who have no internet problems to open their camera. This way, the test will give the students real experiences of handling their FLA and a large number of audiences listening to their speech. A follow-up research that compares students’ achievement in online public speaking class and offline public speaking class can be done to have a better depth comparison between these two teaching methods.

References


